UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

--- X
                                                        :
                                                        :   No. 1:25-md-03143-SHS-OTW
IN RE: OPENAI, INC. COPYRIGHT   :
INFRINGEMENT LITIGATION   :   Hon. Sidney H. Stein
                                                        :   Hon. Ona T. Wang
                                                        :
--- X
                                                        :
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO: :
                                                        :
Case No. 1:23-cv-11195-SHS-OTW   :
Case No. 1:24-cv-03285-SHS-OTW   :
Case No. 1:24-cv-04872-SHS-OTW   :
                                                        :
--- X

OPENAI'S AMENDED ANSWER TO DAILY NEWS PLAINTIFFS' COMPLAINT

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 15, Defendants OpenAI, Inc., OpenAI LP,[1]

OpenAI GP, LLC, OpenAI, LLC, OpenAI OpCo, LLC, OpenAI Global, LLC, and OAI

Corporation, LLC[2] (collectively, "OpenAI"), by and through the undersigned counsel, submit the

following answer to Plaintiffs Daily News, LP, Chicago Tribune Company, LLC, Orlando Sentinel

Communications Company, LLC, Sun-Sentinel Company, LLC, San Jose Mercury-News, LLC,

DP Media Network, LLC, ORB Publishing, LLC and Northwest Publications, LLC's (collectively,

"Plaintiffs") Complaint.

OpenAI states that the headings and sub-headings throughout the Complaint do not

constitute well-pleaded allegations of fact and, therefore, require no response. To the extent a

response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations contained in the Complaint's headings

and sub-headings.

OpenAI denies all allegations in the Complaint that are not explicitly admitted and

otherwise answers as follows:

I.   RESPONSE TO NATURE OF THE ACTION[3]

1.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations

of this paragraph about Plaintiffs and about Microsoft, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI

admits that OpenAI, Inc. is a Delaware nonprofit corporation. OpenAI denies the remaining

allegations of this paragraph.

2.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft

Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations

---

[1] OpenAI LP is now known as OpenAI OpCo, LLC.

[2] OAI Corporation, LLC converted in September 2023 from a limited liability company to a corporation named OAI Corporation.

[3] OpenAI neither admits nor denies the contents of the various headings and subheadings in the complaint, which are reproduced herein solely for convenience.

and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that it uses computers and employs programmers and other technical employees to build and operate its products. OpenAI admits that computers contain chips and require electricity to operate. OpenAI admits that it pays for the computers, electricity, and programmers and other technical employees it uses to build and operate its products. OpenAI admits that it pays for the facilities in which it builds and operates its products. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

3.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from portions of a publicly available written response to a committee inquiry, the full text of that response speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with the full text of the response, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

4.   OpenAI admits that it believes that training AI models using publicly available internet materials is fair use, as supported by longstanding and widely accepted precedents. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

5.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

6.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs and about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

7.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

8.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

9.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

10.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

11.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

12.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

13.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs and about Microsoft, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that the models that power ChatGPT are developed using three primary sources of information: (1) information that is publicly available on the internet; (2) information that it partners with third parties to access; and (3) information that its users or human trainers and researchers provide or generate. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

14.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that it believes that training AI models using publicly available internet materials is fair use, as supported by longstanding and widely accepted precedents. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

15.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that Article I,

Section 8, Clause 8 of the United States Constitution grants Congress the power "[t]o promote the Progress of Science and useful Arts, by securing for limited Times to Authors and Inventors the exclusive Right to their respective Writings and Discoveries." To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that Clause, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

16.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs and Microsoft, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. is a Delaware nonprofit corporation. OpenAI admits that its valuation is over $90 billion. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

17.   OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph

II.   RESPONSE TO JURISDICTION AND VENUE

18.   The allegations of this paragraph state a legal conclusion to which no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI admits that this action purports to arise under the copyright laws of the United States, 17 U.S.C. § 101 et seq., and that the Court has original subject matter jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1338(a). OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

19.   For the purposes of this action, OpenAI does not contest personal jurisdiction. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

20.   For the purposes of this action, OpenAI does not contest venue. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

III.   RESPONSE TO THE PARTIES

21.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

22.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

23.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

24.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

25.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

26.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

27.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

28.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them.

29.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that Microsoft committed to a multi-year, multi-billion-dollar investment in OpenAI. OpenAI admits that Microsoft has a minority economic interest in OpenAI Global, LLC, a capped profit company. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

30.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, OpenAI

lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis

denies them. OpenAI admits that it has entered into a strategic partnership with Microsoft that

involves compute, commercial, and investment collaboration. To the extent the allegations of this

paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available earnings call, the full text of the earnings call

speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph summarize or characterize or are

inconsistent with that earnings call, OpenAI denies those allegations. . OpenAI denies any

remaining allegations of this paragraph.

31.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc., OpenAI LP, OpenAI GP, LLC, OpenAI, LLC,

OpenAI OpCo, LLC, OpenAI Global, LLC, OAI Corporation, and OpenAI Holdings, LLC are

Delaware entities. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc., OpenAI LP, OpenAI GP, LLC, OpenAI,

LLC, OpenAI OpCo, LLC, OpenAI Global, LLC, OAI Corporation, and OpenAI Holdings, LLC

are related entities. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

32.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. is a Delaware nonprofit corporation with a

principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. was

formed in December 2015. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

33.   OpenAI admits that the entity formerly known as OpenAI LP was formed in 2018,

renamed "OpenAI LP" in 2019, and is now known as OpenAI OpCo, LLC. OpenAI denies the

remaining allegations of this paragraph.

34.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI GP, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company with

a principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. is the

single member of OpenAI GP, LLC. OpenAI admits that OpenAI GP, LLC is a manager of

OpenAI Global, LLC. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

35.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company with a

principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, LLC was

formed in September 2020. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

36.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI OpCo, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company

with a principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI denies the remaining

allegations of this paragraph.

37.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI Global, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company

with a principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that Microsoft has

a minority economic interest in OpenAI Global, LLC. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations

of this paragraph.

38.   Denied.

39.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI Holdings, LLC is a Delaware limited liability

company with a principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that

OpenAI, Inc. and Aestas, LLC are members of OpenAI Holdings, LLC. OpenAI admits that

Aestas Management Company, LLC is the sole member of Aestas, LLC. OpenAI admits that

Aestas Management Company, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company. OpenAI denies any

remaining allegations of this paragraph.

IV.   RESPONSE TO FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

A.   Response to The Publishers

40.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations

of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

41.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations

of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

42.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations

of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

43.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

44.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

45.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

46.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

47.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

48.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

49.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

50.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

51.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

B.   Response to Defendants' GenAI Products

1.   Response to *A Joint Enterprise Based on Mass Copyright Infringement*

52.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. was formed in 2015 as a non-profit artificial intelligence research company. OpenAI admits that Sam Altman, Greg Brockman, Elon Musk, Reid Hoffman, Jessica Livingston, Peter Thiel, Amazon Web Services, Infosys, and YC Research

committed $1 billion to support OpenAI. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

53.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available press release, the full text of the press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that press release, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

54.   OpenAI admits that it announced the creation of OpenAI LP in March 2019. OpenAI admits that OpenAI LP was a "capped-profit" company. OpenAI admits that OpenAI's valuation is more than $90 billion. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

55.   OpenAI admits that GPT-1 and GPT-2 are open-source and available for public review.   OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

56.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly released research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

57.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available interview, the full text of that interview speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that interview, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

58.   OpenAI admits that it released ChatGPT in November 2022. OpenAI admits that ChatGPT recognizes and processes text inputs from a user and generates text outputs in response.

OpenAI admits that, by April 2024, ChatGPT had more than 100 million users across 185 countries. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

59.   OpenAI admits that OpenAI OpCo, LLC offers products and services powered by its GPT models to consumers and businesses. OpenAI admits that it offers a business-focused service called ChatGPT Enterprise. OpenAI admits that it licenses its technology to corporate clients. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

60.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purports to cite a publicly available press release, the full text of that press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize, characterize, or are inconsistent with that press release, OpenAI denies those allegations. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to cite a publicly available news article, the full text of that news article speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that news article, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

61.   Denied.

62.   Denied.

63.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available interview, the full text of that interview speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that interview, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

64.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

65.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that it has worked with Microsoft to build multiple supercomputing systems powered by Azure, which have been used to train its models. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available speech, the full text of that speech speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that speech, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

66.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available interview, the full text of that interview speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that interview, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

67.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available news article, the full text of that news article speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that

news article, OpenAI denies those allegations. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available press release, the full text of that press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that press release, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

68.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

69.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI admits that it released in beta Internet browsing capabilities within ChatGPT to ChatGPT Plus users in May 2023. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

70.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available interview, the full text of that interview speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that interview, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this

paragraph.

71.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available interview, the full text of that interview speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that interview, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

2.   Response to *How GenAI Models Work*

72.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

73.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

74.   OpenAI admits that its models are made up of large quantities of numbers called "parameters." OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

75.   OpenAI admits that its models are computer programs that are developed using artificial intelligence and machine learning techniques. OpenAI admits that pre-training a model involves teaching language to a model by showing it a wide range of text, and, utilizing sophisticated statistical and computational analysis, having it try to predict the word that comes next in each of a huge range of sentences. OpenAI admits that this process involves breaking text down into roughly word-length "tokens," which are then converted into numbers. OpenAI admits that the model uses the training data to calculate numerical representations of each token's

semantic meaning. OpenAI admits that a process known as a "transformer" then allows the model to understand the context created by surrounding words and sentences, thus enabling an understanding of a word's different meanings depending on context. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

76.   OpenAI admits that a pre-trained model may be fine-tuned. OpenAI admits that fine-tuning may involve training a model on additional text. OpenAI admits that it uses reinforcement learning from human feedback to make its models safer, more helpful, and more aligned. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

77.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available paper, the full text of that paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

78.   OpenAI admits that its models may use Retrieval Augmented Generation. OpenAI admits that this process involves retrieving relevant contextual information from a data source and passing that information to the model alongside the user's input. OpenAI admits that this information is then used to improve the model's output by augmenting the model's base knowledge. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to cite a publicly available press release, the full text of that press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with it, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

C.   Response to Defendants' Unauthorized Use and Copying of the Publishers' Works

79.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

> **1.**   **Response to** *Unauthorized Reproduction of the Publishers' Works During GPT Model Training*

80.   OpenAI admits that GPT models are large language models. OpenAI admits that GPT-1 was first launched in 2018, GPT-2 was first launched in 2019, GPT-3 was first launched in 2020, GPT-3.5 was first launched in 2022, and GPT-4 was first launched in 2023. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

81.   OpenAI admits that pre-training a model involves teaching language to a model by showing the model a wide range of text, and, utilizing sophisticated statistical and computational analysis, having it try to predict the next token in each of a vast number of sequences. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available press release, the full text of that press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that press release, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI admits that it has published information about the pre-training process for GPT models. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

82.   OpenAI admits that GPT-2 is a large transformer-based language model with 1.5 billion parameters. OpenAI admits that GPT-2 was trained using a dataset known as WebText. OpenAI admits that WebText contains a text subset of outbound links from Reddit, a social media platform, that received at least 3 karma. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from publicly available press releases, research papers, or GitHub repositories, the full text and contents of those press releases, research papers, or GitHub repositories speak for themselves. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with those press releases, research papers, or GitHub repositories, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

83.   OpenAI admits that GPT-3 is an autoregressive language model with 175 billion

parameters trained on datasets known as Common Crawl (filtered), WebText2, Books1, Books2, and Wikipedia. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to cite a publicly available research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

84.   OpenAI admits that WebText2 is an expanded version of the WebText dataset created by collecting links over a longer period of time. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

85.   OpenAI admits that a filtered Common Crawl dataset had the highest weight in the training mix for GPT-3. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about C4 or the Common Crawl organization, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

86.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about C4, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

87.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

88.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about "experts," and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

89.   OpenAI admits that it has used the WebText and WebText2 datasets to train GPT models. OpenAI admits that it continues to use training datasets to train GPT models. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

90.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

91.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

92.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

93.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

94.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

95.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations,

and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

> **2.   Response to *Unauthorized Reproductions and Derivatives of the Publishers' Works Embodied in the GPT Models and Unauthorized Public Display of the Publishers' Works in GPT Product Outputs***

96.   OpenAI admits that ChatGPT, ChatGPT Plus, and ChatGPT Enterprise are powered by GPT models. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

97.   Denied.

98.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

99.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

100.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

101.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

102.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

103.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

104.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

105.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

106.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

107.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

108.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

109.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

110.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

111.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

112.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

113.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3.   Response to *Unauthorized Retrieval and Dissemination of Hot News*

114.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

115.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

116.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus

no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

117.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

118.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

119.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

120.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

121.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

122.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

123.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

-22-

124.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

125.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

126.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

127.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

128.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

129.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

130.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

131.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the

allegations of this paragraph.

132.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

133.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

134.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

135.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

136.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

137.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

138.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required.   To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

4.   **Response to *Willful Infringement***

139.   OpenAI admits that it trained, fine-tuned, and tested GPT models. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available paper, the full text of that paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

140.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

141.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

D.   Response to Defendants' Material Contributions to End-User Infringement

142.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

143.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

144.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote a publicly available blog post, the full text of the blog post speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that

blog post, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

145.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about the actions of third parties, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

146.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

147.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available press release, the full text of that press release speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with it, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about the actions of third parties, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

148.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

149.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

150.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

151.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

152.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to reference a publicly available document, the full text of the document speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that document, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

153.   OpenAI admits that it aims for its tools to be used safely and responsibly, and that users agree to usage policies in using its services. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

154.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from OpenAI's publicly available terms of use, the full text of the terms of use speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with the terms of use, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

155.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

156.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

E.   Response to Defendants' Removal of Copyright Management Information from the Publishers' Works

157.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

158.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

159.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

160.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

161.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that research paper, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

162.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

163.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

164.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

165.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

166.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

167.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

168.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to quote from OpenAI's publicly available terms of use, the full text of the terms of use speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with the terms of use, OpenAI denies those allegations. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about purported ChatGPT outputs, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

169.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations

-29-

of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

F.   Response to Hallucinations Falsely Attributed to the Publishers

170.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

171.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information about the allegations of this paragraph about a third party's use of ChatGPT, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

172.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

173.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

174.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

175.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

176.   Denied.

G.   Response to Profit to Defendants

177.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

178.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

179.   OpenAI admits that ChatGPT had more than 100 million users across 185 countries as of April 2024. OpenAI admits that it offers a subscription plan, called ChatGPT plus, available for $20 per month.   OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

180.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to cite a publicly available news article, the full text of that news article speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations of this paragraph purport to summarize or characterize or are inconsistent with that news article, OpenAI denies those allegations.

181.   OpenAI admits that Microsoft invested $1 billion in OpenAI in 2019. OpenAI admits that Microsoft has made additional investments in OpenAI. OpenAI admits that its current valuation is more than $80 billion. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

182.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

183.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

H.   Response to Harm to the Publishers

184.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs and their readers, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

185.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

186.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

187.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Plaintiffs, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

188.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

189.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

Response to COUNT I: Copyright Infringement (17 U.S.C. § 501)

On Behalf of the Publishers Against All Defendants

190.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–189.

191.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

192.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

193.   Denied.

194.   Denied.

195.   Denied.

196.   Denied.

197.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

198.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

199.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

200.   Denied.

201.   Denied.

Response to COUNT II: Vicarious Copyright Infringement

On Behalf of the Publishers Against Microsoft, OpenAI, Inc., OpenAI, GP, OpenAI LP, OAI Corporation, LLC, OpenAI Holdings, LLC, and OpenAI Global, LLC

202.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–201.

203.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

204.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

205.   Denied.

206.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

Response to COUNT III: Contributory Copyright Infringement

On Behalf of the Publishers Against Microsoft

207.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–206.

208.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has not been alleged against OpenAI, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them.

209.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has not been alleged against OpenAI, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them.

210.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has not been alleged against OpenAI, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations about Microsoft Corporation, and on that basis denies them.

Response to COUNT IV: Contributory Copyright Infringement

On Behalf of the Publishers Against All Defendants

211.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–210.

212.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

213.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

214.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

Response to COUNT V: Digital Millennium Copyright Act – Removal of Copyright Management Information (17 U.S.C. § 1202)

On Behalf of the Publishers Against All Defendants

215.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–214.

216.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

217.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

218.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

219.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

220.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

221.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

222.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

223.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

224.   To the extent the allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft Corporation, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny those allegations, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

225.   Denied.

Response to COUNT VI: Common Law Unfair Competition By Misappropriation

On Behalf of the Publishers Against All Defendants

226.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–225.

227.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

228.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

229.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

230.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

231.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

232.   The allegations of this paragraph relate to a claim that has been dismissed, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies the allegations of this paragraph.

Response to COUNT VII: Trademark Dilution (15 U.S.C. § 1125(c))

On Behalf of Daily News, LP; Chicago Tribune Company, LLC; San Jose Mercury-News, LLC; and DP Media Network, LLC Against All Defendants

233.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–232.

234.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

235.   Denied.

236.   Denied.

237.   Denied.

238.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

239.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

240.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

241.   OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

242. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

243.   Denied.

244.   Denied.

245.   Denied.

246.   Denied.

247.   Denied.

248.   Denied.

249.   Denied.

Response to COUNT VIII: Dilution and Injury to Business Reputation
(N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 360-l)

On Behalf of Daily News, LP; Chicago Tribune Company, LLC; San Jose Mercury-News, LLC; and DP Media Network, LLC Against All Defendants

250.   This paragraph incorporates by reference the preceding factual allegations, and thus no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to paragraphs 1–249.

251.   Denied.

252.   Denied.

253.   Denied.

254.   Denied.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

In response to the prayer for relief, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever, including because Plaintiffs have suffered no injury sufficient to confer standing to bring any claim for relief.

DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL

With respect to the jury demand contained in the Complaint, OpenAI states that no response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs' claims are properly triable to a jury.

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

In further answer to the allegations made by Plaintiffs in the Complaint, OpenAI asserts the following affirmative defenses. OpenAI does not concede that it has the burden of proof on the defenses listed below.

FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs do not own or hold exclusive rights under 17 U.S.C. § 106 or any copyright law over each work that was allegedly infringed by OpenAI.

SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because the copyright registrations purporting to cover some or all of the works in dispute are invalid and do not satisfy the requirements of 17 U.S.C. § 411–412.

THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

To the extent there is copying of copyrightable expression, that copying constitutes fair use.

FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of copyright misuse and unclean hands.

FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs have suffered no provable injury as a result of the challenged conduct, which *inter alia* precludes relief under 17 U.S.C. § 1203(a).

SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims fail in whole or in part because the complained-of use was validly licensed by express or implied license.

SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred in whole or in part by the doctrines of waiver, abandonment, and/or forfeiture.

EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrine of laches.

NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrine of estoppel.

TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims fail in whole or in part because OpenAI's conduct was innocent, not willful.

ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' remedies are barred at least in part by the applicable statutes of limitations.

TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs are barred from recovery of damages because of and to the extent of its failure to mitigate its alleged damages (to which, in any event, they are not entitled).

THIRTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, to the extent they claim rights to elements of works or to works which are not protectable under copyright law, or that are in the public domain, lack the requisite originality, are unregistered, or are works to which copyright protection has been abandoned.

FOURTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims of copyright infringement are barred or limited by the doctrine of merger.

FIFTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims of copyright infringement are barred or limited by the idea/expression dichotomy.

SIXTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims of copyright infringement are barred or limited because the material in which Plaintiffs claim copyright constitutes "*scènes à faire*."

SEVENTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

To the extent there is copying of copyrightable expression, that copying is *de minimis*.

EIGHTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims of copyright infringement are barred or limited because the material in which Plaintiffs claim copyright constitutes unprotectible facts.

NINETEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims fail, in whole or in part, because the allegedly violative conduct was innocent pursuant to 17 U.S.C. § 1203(c)(5)(A).

TWENTIETH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims fail, in whole or in part, for failure to state a claim.

TWENTY-FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because the acts alleged in the First Amended Complaint are not an infringement of copyright, including because the alleged acts are fair use and/or de minimis, and/or because copyright protection is barred by the doctrine of merger, the doctrine of scène à faire, or the idea/expression dichotomy.

TWENTY-SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because OpenAI reasonably believed that the acts alleged in the First Amended Complaint were not an infringement of copyright, including because the alleged acts are fair use and/or *de minimis*, and/or because copyright protection is barred by the doctrine of merger, the doctrine of scènes à faire, and/or the idea/expression dichotomy.

TWENTY-THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because OpenAI did not know or have reasonable grounds to know that the acts alleged in the First Amended Complaint were an infringement of copyright, including because the alleged acts are fair use and/or *de minimis*, and/or because copyright protection is barred by the doctrine of merger, the doctrine of *scènes à faire*, and/or the idea/expression dichotomy.

TWENTY-FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs are not entitled to injunctive relief (temporarily, preliminarily, or permanently), including because any injury to it is not immediate or irreparable, Plaintiffs would have an adequate remedy at law, the balance of hardships favors no injunction, and the public interest is best served by no injunction.

TWENTY-FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because any reproduction, distribution, or display of any allegedly infringing outputs, or copies allegedly made in the generative search process, were caused by the acts or omissions of other persons or entities for whose conduct OpenAI is not legally responsible.

TWENTY-SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because they are barred by the safe harbor provisions of the Digital Millennium Copyright Act, 17 U.S.C. § 512 (a)-(d).

TWENTY-SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because all of the models accused of infringement, and all of OpenAI's products and services offered in connection with those accused models, are capable of substantial non-infringing uses.

TWENTY-EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs' allegations do not demonstrate a cognizable trademark use.

TWENTY-NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because Plaintiffs' alleged trademarks are not famous, or inherently distinctive, and have not acquired secondary meaning.

THIRTIETH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because their marks are not sufficiently famous or distinctive to warrant protection under federal or state dilution laws.

THIRTY-ONE AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, based on the doctrine of fair use as the asserted trademarks are descriptive and do not serve as source identifiers.

THIRTY-SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, because OpenAI has not, directly or indirectly, willfully or innocently, diluted Plaintiffs' trademarks.

THIRTY-THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claim for damages is barred by the Eighth and Fourteenth Amendments to the U.S. Constitution.

THIRTY-FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

OpenAI reserves all affirmative defenses under Rule 8(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and any other defenses at law or in equity, that may now exist or in the future become available based on discovery and further factual investigation.

-45-

Dated: May 20, 2025.   MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

                                               By: */s/ Joseph Gratz*
                                               _____
                                                   Joseph C. Gratz (*pro hac vice*)
                                                   jgratz@mofo.com
                                                   425 Market Street
                                                   San Francisco, CA 94105-2482
                                                   Telephone: 415.268.7000
                                                   Facsimile: 415.268.7522

                                                   Rose S. Lee (*pro hac vice*)
                                                   roselee@mofo.com
                                                   707 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 6000
                                                   Los Angeles, CA 90017-3543
                                                   Telephone: 213.892.5200
                                                   Facsimile: 213.892.5454

                                                   Carolyn M. Homer (*pro hac vice*)
                                                   cmhomer@mofo.com
                                                   2100 L Street, NW
                                                   Suite 900
                                                   Washington, D.C. 20037
                                                   Telephone: 202.887.1500
                                                   Facsimile: 202.887.0763

                                                   Emily C. Wood
                                                   ewood@mofo.com
                                                   Eric K. Nikolaides
                                                   enikolaides@mofo.com
                                                   250 W. 55th Street
                                                   New York, NY 10019
                                                   Telephone: 212.468.8000
                                                   Facsimile: 212.468.7900

                                                   Attorneys for Defendants
                                                   OPENAI, INC., OPENAI GP, LLC,
                                                   OPENAI, LLC, OPENAI OPCO LLC,
                                                   OPENAI GLOBAL LLC, OAI
                                                   CORPORATION, LLC, and OPENAI
                                                   HOLDINGS, LLC

Dated: May 20, 2025.   LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

                                         By: */s/ Andrew Gass*
                                             Andrew Gass (*pro hac vice*)
                                             andrew.gass@lw.com
                                             Joseph R. Wetzel
                                             joseph.wetzel@lw.com
                                             505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
                                             San Francisco, CA 94111
                                             Telephone: 415.391.0600

                                             Sarang V. Damle
                                             sy.damle@lw.com
                                             Elana Nightingale Dawson (*pro hac vice*)
                                             elana.nightingaledawson@lw.com
                                             555 Eleventh Street, NW, Suite 1000
                                             Washington, D.C. 20004
                                             Telephone: 202.637.2200

                                             Allison L. Stillman
                                             alli.stillman@lw.com
                                             Rachel R. Blitzer
                                             rachel.blitzer@lw.com
                                             Herman H. Yue
                                             herman.yue@lw.com
                                             Michael A. David
                                             michael.david@lw.com
                                             Luke A. Budiardjo
                                             luke.budiardjo@lw.com
                                             Yijun Zhong
                                             elaine.zhong@lw.com
                                             1271 Avenue of the Americas
                                             New York, NY 10020
                                             Telephone: 212.906.1200

                                             Allison S. Blanco (*pro hac vice*)
                                             allison.blanco@lw.com
                                             650 Town Center Drive, Ste 2000
                                             Costa Mesa, CA 92626
                                             Telephone: (714) 540-1235

                                             Attorneys for Defendants
                                             OPENAI, INC., OPENAI GP, LLC,
                                             OPENAI, LLC, OPENAI OPCO LLC,
                                             OPENAI GLOBAL LLC, OAI
                                             CORPORATION, LLC, and OPENAI
                                             HOLDINGS, LLC

Dated: May 20, 2025.   KEKER, VAN NEST & PETERS LLP

                                                 By: _/s/ Paven Malhotra_
                                                     Robert A. Van Nest (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     RVanNest@keker.com
                                                     R. James Slaughter (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     RSlaughter@keker.com
                                                     Paven Malhotra
                                                     PMalhotra@keker.com
                                                     Michelle S. Ybarra (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     MYbarra@keker.com
                                                     Nicholas S. Goldberg (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     NGoldberg@keker.com
                                                     Thomas E. Gorman (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     TGorman@keker.com
                                                     Katie Lynn Joyce (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     KJoyce@keker.com
                                                     Christopher S. Sun (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     CSun@keker.com
                                                     Andrew S. Bruns (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     ABruns@keker.com
                                                     Andrew Dawson (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     ADawson@keker.com
                                                     Edward A. Bayley (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     EBayley@keker.com
                                                     Eric Meyer (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     EMeyer@keker.com
                                                     Jamie T. Martinez (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     JMartinez@keker.com
                                                     Kevin S. Song (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     KSong@keker.com
                                                     Leo L. Lam
                                                     LLam@keker.com
                                                     Luis G. Hoyos (*pro hac vice*)
                                                     LHoyos@keker.com

                                                     Attorneys for Defendants
                                                     OPENAI, INC., OPENAI GP, LLC,
                                                     OPENAI, LLC, OPENAI OPCO LLC,
                                                     OPENAI GLOBAL LLC, OAI
                                                     CORPORATION, LLC, and OPENAI
                                                     HOLDINGS, LLC